

Georgina Rabassó\*

## Traces of Augustine of Hippo in Hildegard of Bingen's Visual Thoughts on Eternity and Time

### Abstract

Geometry has proven to be a valuable resource in the history of philosophy for representing a range of concepts in the semantic domain of time. A series of segments, lines, circles, polygons and other figures have been used to translate visually and symbolically the ideas of time and eternity for the purposes of understanding them better, fostering reflection, and explaining them in a didactic manner. Time is central to Augustine of Hippo's thought, and Book XI of the *Confessiones* is the main vehicle for its transmission. While it is not known whether Hildegard of Bingen read these pages, the Rhenish *magistra's* vision of eternity and time shows a notable affinity with aspects of Augustinian thought. The visual representations in Hildegard's *Liber diuinorum operum* (I, 2-3; III, 5) are used here to illustrate this possible influence (or confluence). In the visions and the miniatures that accompany them, the circle represents eternity, the diameter represents time, and the dot represents the present instant that connects both.

**Keywords:** time; eternity; visual translation; *Confessiones*; *Liber diuinorum operum*.

**Ancient and medieval authors:** Augustine of Hippo; Hildegard of Bingen.

### Vestígios de Agostinho de Hipona nos pensamentos visuais de Hildegarda de Bingen sobre a eternidade e o tempo

#### Resumo

A geometria provou ser um recurso valioso na história da filosofia por representar uma gama de con-

---

\* Researcher, ADHUC – Research Centre for Theory, Gender, Sexuality, University of Barcelona; Lecturer, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Philosophy, Universitat de Barcelona, Montalegre, 6, 08001 Barcelona, Spain, and Department of Humanities, Faculty of Humanities, Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Ramon Trias Fargas, 25-27, 08005 Barcelona, Spain; georginagonzalezrabbasso@ub.edu

ceitos no domínio semântico do tempo. Uma série de segmentos, linhas, círculos, polígonos e outras figuras têm sido usadas para traduzir visual e simbolicamente as ideias do tempo e da eternidade com o objectivo de as compreender melhor, promovendo a reflexão e explicando-as de uma forma didáctica. O tempo é central ao pensamento de Agostinho de Hipona, e o Livro XI das *Confessiones* é o principal veículo para a sua transmissão. Embora não se saiba se Hildegarda de Bingen leu estas páginas, a visão da eternidade e do tempo da *magistra* Renana mostra uma notável afinidade com aspectos do pensamento agostiniano. As representações visuais no *Liber diuinorum operum* (I, 2-3; III, 5) de Hildegarda são aqui usadas para ilustrar esta possível influência (ou confluência). Nas visões e nas miniaturas que as acompanham, o círculo representa a eternidade, o diâmetro representa o tempo, e o ponto representa o instante presente que liga ambos.

**Palavras chave:** tempo; eternidade; tradução visual; *Confessiones*, *Liber diuinorum operum*.

**Autores antigos e medievais:** Agostinho de Hipona; Hildegarda de Bingen.

*El tiempo se toma su tiempo y a veces ni eso.*

## 1. Augustine, Hildegard's explicit and implicit source

The *auctoritates* that Hildegard of Bingen (1098-1179) makes explicit in her work are scarce and, although the richness of her thought suggests possible inspiration from very diverse sources, this question has been more discussed than agreed upon in the critical literature, and we can rarely reach firm conclusions about it. Moreover, it is very difficult to trace the textual and conceptual parallels in her writings, since she not only neglects to cite her possible models, but also transforms them into the framework of her own imaginary. Consequently, it seems that we can only speak of «traces» of certain authors in Hildegard's thought: traces as erased lines that maintain a certain presence, like furrows; traces as echoes of other texts that the Hildegardian corpus might imperceptibly incorporate in its construction; and these metaphors can serve as an introduction to the issue of her «uncertain readings», to borrow Sylvain Gouguenheim's expression<sup>1</sup>.

<sup>1</sup> S. Gouguenheim, *La Sibylle du Rhin: Hildegarde de Bingen, abbesse et prophétesse rhénane*, Publications de la Sorbonne, Paris 1996, p. 56. There is an abundant bibliography, and different positions within it, on the possible sources of Hildegard's inspiration. See, among other studies: V. Ranff, «Haben Hildegards Visionen Quellen?», in Ä. Bäumer-Schleinkofer (ed.), *Hildegard von Bingen in ihrem Umfeld - Mystik und Visionsformen in Mittelalter und früher Neuzeit. Katholizismus und Protestantismus im Dialog*, Religion & Kultur-Verlag, Würzburg 2001, pp. 105-121; P. Donke, «Platonic-Christian Allegories in the Homilies of Hildegard of Bingen», in H.J. Westra (ed.), *From Athens to Chartres. Neoplatonism and Medieval Thought. Studies in Honour of Édouard Jeuneau*, Brill, Leiden – New York – Cologne 1992, pp. 382-396.

Accounting for the influence of the North African philosopher Augustine of Hippo (354-430) on Hildegard presents an additional obstacle: Augustinian thought is so thoroughly diffused in medieval texts that it is almost impossible to argue rigorously that through a direct reading of his texts, and not through indirect sources, his ideas arrived at the *scriptorium* of the monastery of Rupertsberg in Bingen, the catalogue of whose library has not survived. However, a careful reading of Hildegard's corpus shows that Augustine was not just one amongst many sources of inspiration, but one of her favourite authors. This position is shared by more than a few scholars, although I would like to offer a personal, concrete testimony so that a valuable but evanescent oral transmission may go on record here.

Following in the steps of my mentor Rosa Rius Gatell, who preceded me in July 1998, in June 2011 I found myself in a small room at the Abtei St. Hildegard in Eibingen with the Benedictine scholar Angela Carlevaris, pioneer in the recovery of Hildegard's thought and legacy, collaborator on Adelgundis Führkötter's critical edition of the *Sciuias*, editor of the *Liber uite meritorum (LVM)* and tireless tracer of primary sources, as the profuse critical apparatus of the *LVM* testifies<sup>2</sup>. In one of our several fruitful meetings Carlevaris remarked that, if I was interested in the philosophical background of Hildegard's thought<sup>3</sup>, I should investigate Augustine's influence. In the end I did not address this in my doctoral thesis<sup>4</sup> (discussing the Platonic background instead), and thus it remained as research to be undertaken in the form of a monograph, since for the time being, while there was no exhaustive investigation of this broad topic, there were references to it both in the critical literature and in the critical apparatus of the canonical editions. A project of such scope certainly exceeds the limits of an article, hence here I focus on a more limited theme: the possible Augustinian background of Hildegard's visualisation of the concepts of time and eternity in three visions in the *LDO* (I, 2-3; III, 5).

<sup>2</sup> Hildegardis Bingensis, *Liber uite meritorum*, ed. A. Carlevaris, (CCCM, 90) Brepols, Turnhout 1995.

<sup>3</sup> G. Rabassó, «*Sapientia docet me: Hildegard of Bingen and philosophy*», *Mediaevalia. Textos e estudos* 35 (2016) 7-50. <http://ojs.letras.up.pt/index.php/mediaevalia/article/view/2769>

<sup>4</sup> G. Rabassó, «*Subtilitates naturae. Continuïtats i ruptures a la cosmologia d'Hildegarda de Bingen (1098-1179)*», doctoral thesis, Universitat de Barcelona, Barcelona 2015. <http://hdl.handle.net/2445/96660>; Id., *L'univers vivent d'Hildegarda de Bingen: perspectives filosòfiques*, prologue by R. Rius Gatell, Diputació de Barcelona - Institut d'Estudis Catalans, Barcelona 2018.

Returning to the question of sources of inspiration, I would like to cite Barbara Newman here: «The paradox of Hildegard's *docta ignorantia* must be resolved not in terms of how much she knew, but of how she knew»<sup>5</sup>, drawing attention to its final phrase: what is important is *how she knew*. The gnoseological dimension in which the author moves is the *uisio*: the vision captured by the inner senses in the soul and which interprets a *uox de caelo*<sup>6</sup>. If we are attentive to Hildegard's words, it is the visual and the auditory that constitute her cognitive process. This phenomenon has always aroused enormous interest: in the 1920s Charles Singer, for example, analysed the illustrations in the *Sciuias* and concluded that Hildegard suffered from scintillating scotoma, which he argued represented an important element in her creative and intellectual process<sup>7</sup>. For his part, Jeffrey Hamburger, in his well-known volume *The Visual and the Visionary* (1998) proposed an innovative (and controversial) method of interdisciplinary analysis of the visual component of female spirituality in medieval Germanic manuscripts<sup>8</sup>.

The main hypothesis of this article is that Hildegard often transforms and introduces her textual sources of inspiration into her own imagination through images or visual representation. In particular, in my view the image of the wheel of eternity in the vision that closes the *LDO* is an attempt (or might function as an attempt) to translate Augustine's reflection on time and eternity in the *Confessiones* into visual form. Before proceeding with this analysis, however, we must first provide some relevant information on Hildegard's references to Augustine in order to demonstrate the probability of his being one of her sources.

<sup>5</sup> B. Newman, «Hildegard of Bingen: Visions and Validation», *Church History* 54, 2 (1985) p. 170.

<sup>6</sup> At the same time, Augustine receives the revelation of a *cloud uox*. Sancti Augustini, *Confessionum Libri XIII [Confessiones]*, XI, vi (8), ed. L. Verheijen, (CCSL) Brepols, Turnhout 1981, p. 198, l. 24.

<sup>7</sup> Ch. Singer, «The Scientific Views and Visions of St. Hildegard of Bingen», in Ch. Singer (ed.), *Studies in the History and Method of Science*, Clarendon Press, Oxford 1917, pp. 1-55; Id., «The Visions of Hildegard of Bingen», in Ch. Singer, *From Magic to Science. Essays on the Scientific Twilight*, Ernest Benn Ltd, London 1928, pp. 199-239. Oliver Sacks popularised Singer's interpretation in «The Visions of Hildegard», in O. Sacks, *The Man Who Mistook His Wife for a Hat and other clinical tales*, Perennial Library, New York 1985.

<sup>8</sup> J.F. Hamburger, *The Visual and the Visionary: Art and Female Spirituality in Late Medieval Germany*, Zone Books, New York 1998. From a different perspective, but emphasising Hildegard's visual representation and, above all, her circular thinking, see: E. Gössmann, «Zirkuläres Denken und kosmische Spekulationen im 12. Erläutert an Hildegard von Bingen und Alanus von Lille», in *Fernöstische Weisheit und christlicher Glaube. Festgabe für Heinrich Dumoulin SJ zur Vollendung des 80. Lebensjahres*, Matthias-Grünewald-Verlag, Mainz 1985, pp. 147-159.

The Bible and her own revelations in the *uisio* and *auditio* are almost the only explicit sources for Hildegard. We know, however, that reading patristic texts was a significant part of a nun's training in the twelfth century<sup>9</sup>. Therefore, the omission of *auctoritates* would not be an absence due to ignorance but instead an authorial decision, probably meant to show that true authority comes only from God. Nevertheless, in her *Expositiones euangeliorum*, the first known work of systematic exegesis written by a woman, Hildegard refers to the *doctrine* of the *doctors noui testamenti* and mentions Augustine. This is in homily 47:

When Jesus, the Son of God, drew near to Jerusalem, clearly, when the fullness of time came, in which God sent his Son so that human beings would see him incarnate, he saw the city, every edifice of the Old Law from Abel all the way to himself, and he wept over it, so that he might draw forth the fountain of wisdom over all its writings and institutions. [He was] saying: 'If only you knew on this your day the things that bring you peace: in other words, the things I know. You are under the devil's shadowy influence; you do not recognize me because you have never seen me. Now you have the law in the fullness of your will, as it pleases you. But now the things that bring you peace are hidden from your eyes, that is, they are concealed from your knowledge.

Indeed, the days will come upon you, and surround you, and hem you in on all sides, and cast you to the ground, and your children who are within you. Clearly others will come in transformation and clarity, the doctors of the New Testament with their teaching: Gregory, Ambrose, Augustine, Jerome, and others like them. They will return to the spiritual meaning and will cleanse from pride your worship with the sacrifice of rams and bulls and cast it down toward humility; by spiritual understanding they will lead carnal institutions toward humility. And they will not leave a stone upon a stone, that is, they will leave no letter-not one iota, and no worship of yours, unless it is changed. Because you have not known the time of your visitation, that is, because you have refused to know the first day on which all creatures will be resplendent, so that another light would shine on your children<sup>10</sup>.

<sup>9</sup> A. Carlevaris, «Hildegarda e la Patristica», in C. Burnett – P. Dronke (eds.), *Hildegard of Bingen. The Context of her Thought and Art*, The Warburg Institute, London 1998, pp. 65-80.

<sup>10</sup> Hildegardis Bingensis, *Expositiones euangeliorum* [EE], '47', ed. B.M. Kienzle – C.A. Muessig, in *Opera minora*, eds. P. Dronke – C.P. Evans – H. Feiss – B. M. Kienzle – C.A. Muessig – B. Newman, (CCCM, 226) Brepols, Turnhout 2007, pp. 185-333; 312-313, l. 1-19: «Cum appropinquaret, id est cum uenit plenitudo temporis in quo misit Deus filium suum, Iesus, scilicet filius Dei, Ierusalem, ita ut homines eum uiderent incarnatum, uidens ciuitatem, uidelicet omnem edificationem ueteris legis ab Abel usque ad se, fleuit, ita ut educeret fontem sapientiae, super illam, scilicet super omnes litteras et institutiones eius, dicens: Quia si cognouisses et tu quae ego, quia tu quae es in tenebrosa suasionem diaboli non cognoscis me, quia nunquam uidisti me. Et quidem in hac die tua, quoniam nunc habes legem in plenitudine uoluntatis tuae, quae ad pacem tibi, id est ut tibi placet, nunc autem abscondita sunt, ita ut lateant, ab oculis tuis, scilicet scientiam tuam. Quia uenient dies in te, uidelicet alii in transmutatione et claritate, et circumdabunt te doctores noui testamenti doctrina sua, ut Gregorius, Ambrosius, Augustinus, Ieronimus,

With regard to the *plenitudo temporis* and the Second Coming, Hildegard conveys a message of salvation: both humans and institutions tend to forget that what is essential is invisible, immaterial. She adds that the devil must be kept at bay by drinking from the fountain of wisdom, that is, by cultivating the «spiritual understanding» (*in spiritale intellectu*) promoted by the doctors of the Church, who, with their reflections on sacrifice and humility, guide Christians on the way to salvation. They, according to Beverly M. Kienzle, «carry out the change: once the Word-human brings the Word-text, they endue it with the new spiritual meaning»<sup>11</sup>. Thus the explicit connection to Augustine in these lines is materialised in the kind of knowledge that should prepare human beings for the approaching end of time.

At the beginning of the homily, there also appears the image of Jerusalem and «every edifice of the Old Law», which Jesus contemplates when he becomes incarnate. Certainly, the reflection on cities can have a scriptural basis (Jerusalem, Babel, etc.) and not necessarily an Augustinian one. The city as a symbol of the Christian community, however, is a markedly Augustinian theme and is also the protagonist of the five visions in the third part of the *LDO*<sup>12</sup>, in which the temporal development of the history of Christianity is explained up to the Last Judgement, when all that exists is integrated into the eternal dimension of life in God. Secondly, although Hildegard refers to Augustine's doctrine as a useful teaching to guide the believer in worldly life and before the Last Judgement, she did not necessarily use Augustine's doctrines to explain the concept of *plenitudo temporis*. Hildegard's reflection on Creation as the transition from the eternal to the temporal and the end of time as the transition from the temporal to the eternal may be based on biblical passages and not on the *Confessiones*. Finally, it could

---

et alii similes, *et coangustabunt te undique*, scilicet reuertendo in spiritalem significationem, *et ad terram posternent te*, id est culturam tuam in sacrificio arietum et taurorum abstergent ab elatione et ad humilitatem posternent, *et filios tuos qui in te sunt*, scilicet carnales institutiones in spiritale intellectu ad humilitatem ducent. *Et non relinquent lapidem*, id est nullam litteram, nec iota unum, nec ulla culturam tuam, *super lapidem*, nisi mutetur; *eo quod cognoueris tempus uisitacionis tuae*, quia scire noluisti primum diem in quo omnes creaturae fulminabunt, ita ut aliud lumen in filiis tuis fulgeat». Hildegard of Bingen, *Homilies on the Gospels*, B.M. Kienzle (tr.), Cistercian Publications – Liturgical Press, Collegeville 2011, p. 178.

<sup>11</sup> B.M. Kienzle, *Hildegard of Bingen and her Gospel Homilies. Speaking New Mysteries*, Brepols, Turnhout 2009, p. 81.

<sup>12</sup> P. Dronke, «The Symbolic Cities of Hildegard of Bingen», *The Journal of Medieval Latin* 1 (1991) 168-183; V. Cirlot, «La ciudad celeste de Hildegard von Bingen», *Anuario de Estudios Medievales* 44, 1 (2014) 505-541.

be objected that one would have to analyse in detail these different themes in the patristic authors she mentions in the quoted passage. Nevertheless, the existence of homily 47 objectively proves the basis of the present analysis: that Augustine is one of the few specific authors that Hildegard explicitly acknowledges.

Regarding the passage from the eternal to the temporal, or the Creation of the world, José Carlos Santos Paz points out that, if we take into account the 12<sup>th</sup>-century interest in the commentaries on Genesis and in particular the conceptual and textual parallels indicated in the critical apparatus of the *LDO* and the *Cause et cure*, Hildegard may have known Augustine's *De Genesi ad litteram*<sup>13</sup>. Therefore, there is evidence to argue that her reflection on the transition eternity-time-eternity is significantly based on Augustine. In the following sections of this paper, I analyse Hildegard's visual and auditory representation<sup>14</sup> of the transition from eternity to time (*LDO*, I, 2-3) and from time to eternity (*LDO*, III, 5), alongside the Augustinian traces we find in them. My hypothesis, however, does not focus on the question of the *textual* or *conceptual* source of the vision, but instead aims to analyse the phenomenon of the *visual translation* of ideas.

Hildegard states that vision is the only source of her knowledge, and perhaps this can also be understood in the sense that *visualisation* is the main source of her thinking. The *uisio*, an allegorical and sometimes symbolic image, is deciphered through the commentary which, according to the author, she hears uttered by the *uox de caelo*. In this way, she reflects on the image contemplated for a long time in her soul<sup>15</sup>, and this image constitutes a visual synthesis of the narrated content. These images could be inspired by multiple sources: other iconographies, her

<sup>13</sup> J.C. Santos Paz, «Hildegard's conscious vision and Adam's dream according to Eriugena», in C. Pisano – D. Solvi (eds.), *Stati alterati di coscienza come pratica rituale. Documenti, testimonianze e rappresentazioni*, Agorà & Co., Lugano 2018, pp. 99-129; 102, n. 15. See also the comparative analysis of the explanation of the visionary phenomenon according to Hildegard and Augustine (ibid., 102-107).

<sup>14</sup> Augustine's influence on Hildegard's musical theory and emotions is examined by Cecilia Panti in «*Verbum cordis e ministerium vocis*: il canto emozionale di Agostino e le visioni sonore di Hildegard di Bingen», in M. Cristiani – C. Panti – G. Perillo (eds.), «*Harmonia mundi*». *Musica mondana e musica celeste fra Antichità e Medioevo. Atti del Convegno internazionale di studi (Roma, 14-15 dicembre 2005)*, SISMEL - Edizioni del Galluzzo, Florence 2007, pp. 167-199.

<sup>15</sup> Hildegardis Bingensis, *Epistolarium. Pars secunda XCI-CCLR*, 103R, ed. L. van Acker, (CCCM, 91a) Brepols, Turnhout 1993, p. 261, l. 70-75: «Ista autem nec corporeis auribus audio nec cogitationibus cordis mei, nec ulla collatione sensuum meorum quinque percipio, sed tantum in anima mea, apertis exterioribus oculis, ita ut numquam in eis defectum extasis patiar; sed uigilanter die ac nocte illa uideo».

own imagination, her own or other people's ideas, oral or textual sources, and so on; materials that Hildegard could somehow transfer to the visualised image. The author's creative process is rooted in vision, and the images contemplated are subsequently translated and adapted into texts that describe what appears in them and how the divine voice interprets them. In addition to using a fundamentally visual language – an original approach for a thinker – Hildegard's images are endowed with great originality, probably because they are not formalised directly from previous iconographic models. In the following section I examine some ideas on time and eternity from Book XI of the *Confessiones* which seem to have been translated into images in the *LDO*'s visions.

## 2. The wheel of eternity and the diameter of time

In the first part of her third book of visions, Hildegard explains the generation of the multiplicity of the created world from God (*LDO*, I, 2), and in the last vision she explains how the return of the worldly multiplicity to the divine unity takes place (*LDO*, III, 5). These two visions have elements in common both in their description and in their visual representation. Here I focus on one fundamental aspect: the structure of the circle and its diameter as a geometrically-based allegorical figuration of the concepts of eternity (circle) and time (diameter). Due to the *visual* component of the *vision*, the textual analysis is also supported by the illustrations from the illuminated manuscript of the *LDO* produced in Rupertsberg in 1220/1230 – not supervised by Hildegard, but very close to her writing – and preserved in the Biblioteca Statale at Lucca in Italy (codex 1942).

<sup>16</sup> *LDO*, I, 2, I, p. 65, l. 180-181: «predictę imaginis, in cuius pectore rota apparebat».

<sup>17</sup> *LDO*, I, 1, II, pp. 47-48, l. 1-8.

<sup>18</sup> Ez 1, 15-28; 10, 6; 10, 9; 10, 10. Hildegard quotes this book (Ez 1, 15-28) in her *EE*: in one passage she compares these wheels to the virtues as «forces of the soul» (*uires animae*) (*EE*, <56>, p. 328, l. 11-14) and in another the wheel symbolises life in motion: «nisi rota quae vita est eam circumducatur, non vivit» (*EE*, <35>, p. 284, l. 28-29).

<sup>19</sup> The Visigothic king Sisebutus (612-621) addressed an epistle to Isidore in which he designated the *De natura rerum* as *Liber rotarum*, due to the numerous diagrams that appear in it. He uses the image of the *rota* above all graphically; on the other hand, to describe the universe he refers to the *quinque circuli mundi* of elementary composition that make it up (*De natura rerum*, X, 1). Boethius (*De consolazione philosophiae*, II, 2) points out that the wheel is the symbol of inconstancy, one of the attributes of the goddess Fortuna, who, by turning it, observes how what was below rises and what was above falls.



Fig. 1. Hildegard of Bingen, *Liber diuinarum operum* (I, 2), 9r. 13<sup>th</sup> Century, Biblioteca Statale di Lucca, ms. 1942, fol. 9r.

By permission of the Ministry of Culture - State Library of Lucca.  
No further reproduction or duplication by any means is permitted.

In the second vision of the *LDO* Hildegard describes the *rota mirificę* from which the world arises in the breast<sup>16</sup> of the personification of the *igneis uis*, also called divine love, spirit and invisible life that sustains all (Fig. 1)<sup>17</sup>. The image of the cosmic wheel encircled by a winged figure refers to Ezekiel's celestial vision of four intertwined wheels, shining like topaz and accompanied by cherubim<sup>18</sup>. Unlike the prophet, however, Hildegard describes a single celestial wheel and with this represents the material universe. Her implicit models, then, could also have been the encyclopaedic philosophical tradition (Isidore of Seville, Boethius)<sup>19</sup>, but more probably the *rote pennate* of Dionysius Areopagite.<sup>20</sup> In Hildegard's imagination the circle represents a mathematical-visual metaphor for the connection between divinity and the created world.

Indeed, in its foreknowledge and operation, divinity is like a wheel, whole and utterly undivided, for it has neither beginning nor ending, nor can anything grasp or surround it, for it is outside of time. And as a circle surrounds and contains all that lies inside of it, so holy divinity contains and exceeds all things infinitely, for no one can divide or overcome it in its power, or bring it to an end<sup>21</sup>.

The wheel represents here the unity, integrity and indivisibility of God not only *in prescientia* but also *in opere*. The divinity manifests itself as a wheel that holds everything within it, in both physical and intellectual senses: the infinitely most perfect of all circles. This circle is not the locus of the contents of the created world; rather, it is beyond the idea of concrete space in that it is all-encompassing, indivisible and unending. God's coeternal wheel surrounds the universe; thus in the circular form this double and yet at the same time single reality are interrelated: God and his creation. By creation we do not mean here the actual universe, since «the form of the world exists, indissolubly whirling» (*forma mundi existit insolubiliter uolubilis*)<sup>22</sup> and any representation of it «holds a complete likeness

<sup>20</sup> *De coelesti Hierarchia*, I, XV. See A. Derolez – P. Dronke, «Introduction» to *LDO*, p. XXVII. Augustine uses the expression *rota figuli* to refer to the heavens in *Confessiones*, XI, xxiii (29), p. 208, l. 4.

<sup>21</sup> *LDO*, I, 2, II, p. 66, l. 17-23: «Diuinitas etenim in prescientia et in opere suo uelut rota integra est et nullo modo diuisa, quoniam nec initium nec finem habet nec ab ullo comprehendi potest, quia sine tempore est. Et sicut circulus ea quę intra ipsum latent comprehendit, ita sancta diuinitas infinite omnia comprehendit et supraexcellit, quia ipsam in potentia sua nullus diuidere nec superare nec ad finem perducere poterit», Hildegard of Bingen, *The Book of Divine Works*, N.M. Campbell (tr.), The Catholic University of America Press, Washington D.C. 2018, pp. 54-55.

<sup>22</sup> *LDO*, I, 2, II, p. 66, l. 14; tr. p. 54.

of the figure of the world in every detail, because it exists everywhere whole, round, and whirling. Rather, a globe that is whole and whirling better imitates the form of the world in its every part»<sup>23</sup>. God alone knows the exact shape of the world, and this knowledge is beyond the rational scope of human understanding.

The second noteworthy aspect of this and the following vision (*LDO*, I, 3) is their visual representation of the diameter of the eternal wheel. In both miniatures a golden line crosses the circle horizontally, passing in one case in front of the globe and the human being (*LDO*, I, 2) and in the other behind both (*LDO*, I, 3; Fig. 2). A further difference between these miniatures is that while the first image shows a network of golden lines connecting various parts of the universe, in the second only the single horizontal line spans the circle from one side to the other. The multiple rays do not emanate from the fixed stars located in the bright fire, but from the main winds, represented as beasts. Specifically, in the first of these visions, one ray unites the jaws of the bear (northern wind, emanating from the area of the black fire) and the lion (southern wind, emanating from the area of the bright fire), together with the breaths that energise the elements and which, by exerting their influence on the organs of the body, affect the human being's state of health. The meaning Hildegard attaches to this north-south line<sup>24</sup> is the transition from life to death, and thus it has to do with the expiration of the mundane. At the end of the passage, however, the emphasis is on the balance of forces and the restraint that the southern wind must exert in order to moderate the negative influence of the northern wind.

This signifies that a ray that comes from the firm course of that brilliance and is led to the course of another collateral wind that goes out from the major north wind. It resists that wind with its moderation, so that it emits its blasts with equal measure<sup>25</sup>.

<sup>23</sup> *LDO*, I, 2, III, p. 66, l. 7-11; tr. p. 55; I quote a longer fragment: «[...] cum neutrum ipsorum similitudinem figurę mundi per omnia teneat, quoniam illa undique integra, rotunda et uolubili existente globus aliquis, qui integer et uolubilis existit, formam ipsius in omni parte potius imitatur».

<sup>24</sup> *LDO*, I, 2, XXXII, p. 94, l. 35-41: «*Et alius at predictam lineam, quę in firmamento a principio orientalis partis prefatę rotę uelut ad finem occidentalis partis ipsius uersus septentrionalem eius plagam extenditur, capite agni illic superius posito, quod a signo capitis ursi exit, dirigitur*».

<sup>25</sup> *LDO*, I, 2, XXXII, p. 94, l. 41-45; tr. p. 85: «Significans etiam quod a robusto splendoris illius tenore radius ueniens ad excursum alterius collateralis uenti, qui de supradicto maiore uento septentrionalis partis exit, ducitur, temperamento suo illi resistens, quatinus equali modo flatus suos emittat».



Fig. 2. Hildegard of Bingen, *Liber diuinorum operum* (I, 3), 13<sup>th</sup> Century, Biblioteca Statale di Lucca, ms. 1942, fol. 28v.

By permission of the Ministry of Culture - State Library of Lucca.  
No further reproduction or duplication by any means is permitted.

In the following vision (*LDO*, I, 3), Hildegard's commentary relates the horizontal line with this last idea: the opposition between the light of the soul, of good works and the virtues as against the darkness of the flesh and the Devil's wiles<sup>26</sup>. Neither of the two visions discussed above deals extensively with the question of time and eternity, but this theme does appear in the vision that opens the book, where Hildegard has the divine *ignea uis* speak these words:

But I also fulfill my function, since all living things are set ablaze from me; and I am uniform life in eternity, which neither begins nor ends. God is this life, self-moving and active, yet one life in three energies. Therefore, Eternity is called the Father, the Word is called the Son, and the breath connecting these two is called the Holy Spirit<sup>27</sup>.

In this life that works in eternity (the Father), the Son is the «Word» from which the world is created, and the Holy Spirit is the «breath» that unites them. Augustine of Hippo discusses these ideas, based on various biblical passages, when he reflects on the Word and the Voice, which are coeternal to God, in Book XI of the *Confessiones*<sup>28</sup>.

### 3. Time, a linear vibration in the eternal circle

In his exegesis of the Bible verses, Augustine reflects on creation and the essence of time in an inner dialogue with God: «Therefore you spoke and they were made, and by your Word you made them (Ps. 32: 9, 6)»<sup>29</sup>. God creates through his Word everything that exists, every object in the world, but before giving life to each particular thing he creates heaven and earth. Augustine endows the Word,

<sup>26</sup> *LDO*, I, 3, III, pp. 120-121, l. 1-26.

<sup>27</sup> *LDO*, I, 1, II, p. 49, l. 39-43; tr. p. 35: «Sed et officialis sum, quoniam omnia uitalia de me ardent, et igitalis uita in eternitate sum, que nec orta est nec finietur; eademque uita se mouens et operans Deus est, et tamen hec uita una in tribus uiribus est. Eternitas itaque Pater, uerbum Filius, spiramen hec duo connectens Spiritus Sanctus dicitur».

<sup>28</sup> In speaking about the influence of the Augustinian doctrine of time, Conti situates the extensive reception of book XI from the middle of the 13<sup>th</sup> century and affirms that previously only the relationship between time and the soul was commented upon. A. Conti, «Introducción», in Agustín de Hipona, *Qué es el tiempo*, A. Conti (ed.), Trotta, Madrid 2011, p. 28.

<sup>29</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, v (7), p. 198, l. 20-22: «Quid enim est, nisi quia tu es? Ergo dixisti et facta sunt atque in uerbo tuo fecisti ea». Saint Augustine, *Confessions*, H. Chadwick (ed.), Oxford University Press, New York 2008, p. 25.

coeternal to God, with agency: the *Fiat* is not only a linguistic manifestation; its pronunciation alone constitutes the world through the divine will. There is, therefore, performativity in the creative act, since the Word is action:

And so by the Word coeternal with yourself, you say all that you say in simultaneity and eternity, and whatever you say will come about does come about. You do not cause it to exist other than by speaking. Yet not all that you cause to exist by speaking is made in simultaneity and eternity<sup>30</sup>.

The Word is the intermediate instance of creation, distinct from the actual creation of objects, as God «made it without using a transient utterance» (*sine transitoria uoce*)<sup>31</sup>. And it is distinct from that voice which, in transiting the air in the form of sound, creates time.

Augustine's text resonates with some ideas found in the passage from Hildegard quoted above: the Word is a doer and is associated with the Word or Son of God, who creates the world. Moreover, this Word is coeternal with God and is not exactly identified with the created world, but is that which connects Creator and Creation. Augustine says that

a created entity belonging to the physical realm existed prior to heaven and earth; and that utterance took time to deliver, and involved temporal changes. However, no physical entity existed before heaven and earth<sup>32</sup>.

This creature in motion – what Plato would call the soul of the world – Hildegard calls the wheel of eternity and is the circle that conceptually connects the infinity of God with the finite periphery of the cosmos. Another aspect in common is that Hildegard gives the name of *spiramen* (associated with the Holy Spirit) and Augustine that of *uox* to the medium constituted by the air in which the Word acquires its materiality. A little further on in the text, Augustine asks how God spoke:

<sup>30</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, vii (9), p. 199, l. 11-14; tr. p. 226: «Et ideo uerbo tibi coaeterno simul et sempiternae dicis omnia, quae dicis, et fit, quidquid dicis ut fiat; nec aliter quam dicendo facis: nec tamen simul et sempiterna fiunt omnia, quae dicendo facis».

<sup>31</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, vi (8), p. 198, l. 18; tr. p. 226.

<sup>32</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, vi (8), p. 198, l. 13-17; tr. pp. 225-226. I quote the full passage: «Si ergo uerbis sonantibus et praeteruntibus dixisti, ut fieret caelum et terra, atque ita fecisti caelum et terram, erat iam creatura corporalis ante caelum et terram, cuius motibus temporalibus temporaliter uox illa percurreret».

That voice is past and done with; it began and is ended. The syllables sounded and have passed away, the second after the first, the third after the second, and so on in order until, after all the others, the last one came, and after the last silence followed. Therefore it is clear and evident that the utterance came through the movement of some created thing, serving your eternal will but itself temporal<sup>33</sup>.

When God speaks, his word is also a voice<sup>34</sup>. When He speaks, the sound transpires and therefore, as we have said, time appears. In the beginning – not in a temporal but in an ontological sense – there is eternity, which Augustine compares to silence, and from which arises the coeternal Word (*Verbum*) and from this in turn, time and the «transient utterance» (*Fiat*) with which every worldly object is created. Thus, silence is to eternity what sound is to time. God's Word tears eternity apart, and what for eternal God is only a sound is equivalent to all that exists for humans: the universe and the history of humanity are contained in that *Fiat*. Although they are disproportionate and even incommensurable, Augustine tries to understand and clarify the concepts of time and eternity, which will be linked by the notion of the «present».

As for time, he wonders whether it can have an objective measure: for instance, the revolutions of the stars. And he concludes that time cannot be identified, as some believe, with the movement of celestial bodies, because, although «no body can be moved except in time», this does not mean that «the actual movement of a body constitutes time»<sup>35</sup>. It is interesting to note a parallel between Augustine's reflection and the *Timaeus* (36bc) with regard to Plato's description of the divisions of the body and soul of the world by means of the letter  $\chi$  (and the sound associated with it). He explains that the four extremities of the sign were extended to form two homocentric circles in motion which, in turn, were cut by the demiurge to form the seven orbits on which the planets began to revolve. This sign and its sound, together with its transformation into the circles of the revolutions, form

<sup>33</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, vi (8), p. 198, l. 24-29; tr. p. 225: «Illa enim uox acta atque transacta est, coepta et finita. Sonuerunt syllabae atque transierunt, secunda post primam, tertia post secundam atque inde ex ordine, donec ultima post ceteras silentiumque post ultimam. Vnde claret atque eminet, quod creaturae motus expressit eam seruiens aeternae uoluntati tuae ipse temporalis».

<sup>34</sup> Hildegard mentions a similar idea in *LDO*, III, 5, viii, p. 418, l. 30-31: «claritasque flammę Spiritus Sancti sonus uerbi est, quod omnia creauit». In the prologue of the Gospel according to John we find no such emphasis on the question of the sound of the Word.

<sup>35</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, xxiv (31), p. 210, l. 2-4; tr. p. 238; I quote the full passage: «Nam corpus nulum nisi in tempore moueri audio; tu dicis. Ipsum autem corporis motum tempus esse non audio: non tu dicis».

both a sonic and visual representation of the creation of matter and time. Therefore, although Augustine does not mention it here, in addition to the Bible he has the *Timaeus* as the basis of his enquiry and, moreover, an implicit visual reference in which the generation of the world and time is represented by geometrical forms.

Continuing his argument, after refuting that time is determined by the movement of the heavenly bodies, Augustine affirms that time is a subjective reality (*In te, anime meus, tempora metior*)<sup>36</sup>, and that past (*praesens de praeteritis*), present (*praesens de praesentibus*) and future (*praesens de futuris*) are the extension of time and exist in the soul in the form of *memoria*, *contuitus* and *expectatio*<sup>37</sup>. Therefore, the core of the question is the present:

Yet if the present were always present, it would not pass into the past: it would not be time but eternity. If then, in order to be time at all, the present is so made that it passes into the past, how can we say that this present also 'is'? The cause of its being is that it will cease to be. So indeed we cannot truly say that time exists except in the sense that it tends towards non-existence<sup>38</sup>.

The time that really exists is the present, but it tends to non-existence and is both without extension and indivisible (*praesens autem nullum habet spatium*)<sup>39</sup>, since if it were extensive or long it would cease to be present and would be divided into past and future. At this point of the book an important aspect of Augustine's thought appears: if the present is always present, it is no longer time but eternity. This, then, is the definition that, with respect to time and, therefore, the world, Augustine offers of the transcendent reality which is eternity and God.

Although Augustine does not explicitly refer to an image or visual metaphor for his reflection on these concepts, it is possible to deduce one (or many) from it. The present, indivisible and without extension, would be a point. Time, which has a beginning and an end (the Creation and Last Judgement), would be a line segment. Finally, eternity, without beginning or end, would be a circle, the first figure, the simplest and most perfect of all. In combining these forms we can obtain a possible representation. The diameter of the circle represents time, a line whose

<sup>36</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, xxvii (36), p. 213, l. 46.

<sup>37</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, xx (26), pp. 206-207, l. 1-7.

<sup>38</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, xiv (17), p. 203, l. 14-19; tr. p. 231: «Praesens autem si semper esset praesens nec in praeteritum transiret, non iam esset tempus, sed aeternitas. Si ergo praesens, ut tempus sit, ideo fit, quia in praeteritum transit, quomodo et hoc esse dicimus, cui causa, ut sit, illa est, quia non erit, ut scilicet non vere dicamus tempus esse, nisi quia tendit non esse?».

<sup>39</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, xv (20), p. 204, l. 53.

beginning and end are joined by its ends to the eternal circle and whose centre is a point: the present, or rather, the instant. This point is the centre of both the circumference (eternity) and the diameter (time), as well as the constituent of any line by definition, since a line is a continuous, indefinite succession of points. The diameter is only apparently proportional to the circle, since it is twice its radius – for Hildegard, the *recta mensura* of the world<sup>40</sup>. In reality, however, the circle, which is infinite, lacks proportion compared to the diameter, which is finite. A representation of this kind, which we can extract (or extrapolate) from Augustine's text, is precisely what we find at the beginning of the *LDO* and especially in the vision that closes the work. Due to the absence of objective evidence, we cannot state with certainty that Hildegard's source was book XI of the *Confessiones*. Nevertheless, it seems to me a significant finding to connect Hildegard's image with Augustine's text and to reflect on the idea of the visual translation of ideas, either by way of direct or indirect influence or due to a confluence between the two thinkers<sup>41</sup>.

#### 4. Axis of time and eternal circle

The second key moment in which the image of the wheel of eternity appears is the last vision in the *LDO* (III, 5), where the transition from time and matter to eternity in God is allegorically explained. Hildegard again illustrates the connection between Creator and Creation through the figure of the circle, but this time from the perspective of the end of time and the Last Judgement. The personification of *Caritas* (the term for Divine Love or Spirit) is shown as a female figure seated on «a wheel of wondrous size»<sup>42</sup>, which is endowed with movement (towards the east) and has various geometrical and allegorical divisions within it. In the previously discussed visions (*LDO*, I, 2-3) the structure of the wheel was at the same time connected with the divine, formed by elemental matter, probably because it referred to the passage from the divine to the temporal and material. In

<sup>40</sup> On the idea of proportion in the cosmology of the *LDO*: G. Rabassó, «*Subtilitates naturae...*», cit. pp. 400-405.

<sup>41</sup> My reflection on the distinction between influence and confluence is inspired by R. Rius Gatell, «À la recherche des savoirs anciens. Simone Weil dans l'air du temps», *Cahiers Simone Weil* 37/3 (2014) 223-238; esp. 229-230.

<sup>42</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, i, p. 405, l. 3-4; tr. p. 416: «quasi rotam mirę amplitudinis».

the last vision, on the other hand, when describing the passage from the material and temporal to the immaterial and eternal, the circle is presented with purified contents, represented by simple geometries and colours with hardly any figurative forms (Fig. 3). Moreover, here the author places greater emphasis on the category of time:

*For near the mountain that you spy as if amid the eastern stretch, [...] you see as if a wheel of wondrous size, in the likeness of a shining cloud and turned toward the east. This shows that God has neither beginning nor end, but exists gently within his works, prepared for all good things. Stretching across its middle from the left side all the way to the right, a line can be seen, its color clouded like human breath. For God's will appears perfectly in the beginning of the fallen world and through to its end stretching into eternity, because he has separated the temporal from the eternal*<sup>43</sup>.

This geometrical allegory of the wheel or circle is an allusion to God in eternity: «God's power indeed is rounded by balanced equality, because it lacks beginning and end»<sup>44</sup>. The circle connects the transcendent and the immanent, and in this sense we understand why, according to Hildegard, God's power «reveals things eternal and temporal as if in a circle that has neither beginning nor end»<sup>45</sup>, since the diameter of the temporal begins and ends in the circle of the eternal. The *uox de caelo* says that God is he «who was and who is, unbound by the terms of time's mutability»<sup>46</sup> and «who was before the beginning and exists too as the beginning and entire course of time»<sup>47</sup>. In dealing with the question of God and eternity as the beginning of time, there is an ambiguity in Hildegard's approach as to whether this beginning has both an ontological and a chronological sense. By

<sup>43</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 407, l. 19-28; tr. pp. 418-419: «*Nam iuxta montem, quem uelut in medio orientalis plagę conspicis, [...] quasi rotam mirę amplitudinis similitudinem candidę nubis habentem et ad orientem uersam uides; quę Deum inicio et fine carentem, sed mitem in operibus suis existentem et ad omnia bona paratum ostendit. Quam in medio in transuersum, scilicet a sinistro latere usque ad dextrum latus suum, linea obscuri coloris uelut halitus hominis est distinguit; quia perfecte per principium caduci mundi et per finem eius ad eternitatem tendentem uoluntas Dei apparet, cum temporalia ab his quę eterna sunt sequestrauit.*

<sup>44</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 408, l. 62-63; tr. p. 420: «*Potestas quidem Dei rotunda equalitate temperantie est, quia inicio caret et fine.*

<sup>45</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 408, l. 72-73; tr. p. 420: «*eterna et temporalia quasi in circulo nec initium nec finem habente demonstrat.*

<sup>46</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 406, l. 1-2, tr. p. 418: «*illius qui erat et qui est absque officio mutabilitatis temporum.*

<sup>47</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 407, l. 17-18, tr. p. 419: «*ante initium fuit et etiam initium et tempus temporum existit.*



Fig. 3. Hildegard of Bingen, *Liber diuinorum operum* (III, 5), 13<sup>th</sup> Century, Biblioteca Statale di Lucca, ms. 1942, fol. 143r.

By permission of the Ministry of Culture - State Library of Lucca.  
No further reproduction or duplication by any means is permitted.

using expressions such as *ante incium fuit et etiam incium et tempus temporum existit*, already quoted, and *ante principium mundi et post finem eius*<sup>48</sup>, amongst others, Hildegard dissociates herself from the Augustinian position, according to which it is nonsense to speak of time having a before and after, since these terms are inseparable from temporality and cannot be applied to eternity<sup>49</sup>. In contrast, Hildegard does ascribe temporal notions to eternity, not only in the *LDO*, but also in other writings. In her homily 47, mentioned above, she even refers to the first day of eternity: «the first day on which all creatures will be resplendent»<sup>50</sup>, an idea that does not fit into Augustine's theoretical framework.

Returning to the analysis of the final vision of the *LDO*, the transverse line (*linea iterum*) of the circle represents the temporal order, that is, the worldly time in which human history takes place and which the author identifies with the Judeo-Christian tradition. Hildegard states that this line separates the temporal from the eternal and that God's will is manifested throughout the ages of the world by its greenness<sup>51</sup>. In the vision, this line on which *Caritas* sits begins to move, the contents that allegorically occupy the surface of the circle undergo some modifications and some colours are transformed, as an allusion to the purification of all that exists in the created world. This purification (which also appears at the end of the *Sciuias* in the form of a *conflagratio* or *ekpyrosis*) takes place in the *plenitudo temporis*, with the coming of the Son of God, «whom I send mightily under *the silence of my will*, when the strength of each time period [has] passed away, [and] the judgements of my power [come] to pass in the redness of justice»<sup>52</sup>. Hildegard writes that God's will is silent (which reminds us of the silence of eternity in Augustine) and will welcome in its eternal bosom all of the blessed in «the heavenly city, which is the dwelling place of God's children»<sup>53</sup>, when the world reaches the  *aureus numerus*.<sup>54</sup> With this arithmetical and symbolic reference Hildegard refers

<sup>48</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 407, l. 34-35.

<sup>49</sup> *Confessiones*, XI, XII (14), p. 201; XI, XIV (17), pp. 202-203.

<sup>50</sup> *EE*, <47>, p. 313, l. 22-23; tr. p. 178: «primum diem in quo omnes creaturae fulminabunt».

<sup>51</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, II, p. 409, l. 79-83.

<sup>52</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, V, p. 412, l. 17-19; tr. p. 424: «quem transacta fortitudine temporum in fine eorum potenter sub *silentio uoluntatis meę* misi, iudicia potestatis meę in ruborem iusticię transierunt» italics mine in both cases.

<sup>53</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, VI, p. 413, l. 16; tr. p. 425: «Celestis etiam illa ciuitas, quę Dei filiorum habitaculum est». This image appears in all the visions in the third part of the work, as I said, and constitutes a reflection that echoes Augustine's ideas of the earthly city and the heavenly city.

<sup>54</sup> *LDO*, III, 5, XII, p. 429, l. 10.

both to the end of time, which was foreseen from its beginning<sup>55</sup>, and to each of its intermediate stages.

*But the half of this wheel that stretches all the way across beneath the aforesaid line shows a pale color intermingled with blackness.* This indicates that the fallen time spans of worldly things have a beginning and an end, and over them rules unending eternity, unbounded by any end<sup>56</sup>.

In her vision Hildegard describes other divisions of this wheel of eternity, and the essential message she wishes to convey to the faithful is the need to reflect on their journey along the diameter that also represents, on a small scale, their own lives. In an earlier vision Hildegard had reflected on the place in which the human being is situated: the centre of both creation and the universe. This location is also a crossroads (*homo quasi in biuio est*): the centre is the present, the point of junction between the temporal and the eternal (according to Augustine, eternity is a continuous present), the point of union between divinity and the human being, and the possibility of choice by which human beings constantly have the opportunity, if they care for their own good, to freely accept God's will and save their soul. The present is therefore the time of virtue which will lead the believer to eternal salvation.

## Conclusion

Although Augustine of Hippo is one of the few explicit *auctoritates* in Hildegard of Bingen's work, the author's reception of his writings and, in particular, of Book XI of the *Confessiones*, cannot be proven either by documentary evidence (as the Rupertsberg library holdings are not preserved) or textual evidence (as Hildegard does not cite her sources). Moreover, due to the visual factor in Hilde-

<sup>55</sup> LDO, III, 5, xxiii, p. 444, l. 17-18: «plenitudo, quę in primo facta est», «in principio mundi finem mundi inspexisti».

<sup>56</sup> LDO, III, 5, ii, p. 408, l. 51-55; tr. p. 419: «Medietas uero eiusdem rotę quę sub predicta linea in transuersum ducitur, colorem pallidum quadam nigredine intermixtum demonstrat; quia caduca tempora mundialium rerum incium et finem habentia, quibus indeficiens eternitas nullo fine conclusa dominatur, designat».

gard's visionary corpus, ideas from possible sources of reference are transformed through visual representation and allegory. Since moving images together with audition (both of these in a revealed sense) are the starting point for her writing, both description and commentary, we must see Hildegard's thought as having a visual root: it is a way of thinking radically with and from images – and also sounds. Whether by way of influence (direct or indirect) or confluence, Hildegard translates the ideas of time and eternity into visual representation with a remarkable affinity to Augustine's text. The images of the *LDO* can be seen as visualisations of fundamental concepts from the *Confessiones* mainly in the form of two idea-figures: the circle representing eternity and the diameter symbolising time. *Caritas*, the substance of divinity, is located at the centre of the wheel (the place where in previous visions the human being had been located): that point which symbolises the present and which connects, despite its lack of proportion, time and eternity, both in Augustine's formulation and in Hildegard's vision.

## Bibliography

### Primary sources (critical editions and translations)

Hildegardis Bingensis, *Epistolarium. Pars secunda XCI-CCLR*, 103R, ed. L. van Acker, (CCCM, 91a) Brepols, Turnhout 1993

— *Liber uite meritorum*, ed. A. Carlevaris, (CCCM, 90) Brepols, Turnhout 1995.

— *Expositiones euangeliorum [EE]*, '47', ed. B.M. Kienzle – C.A. Muessig, in *Opera minora*, ed. P. Dronke – C.P. Evans – H.B. Feiss – M. Kienzle – C.A. Muessig – B. Newman, (CCCM, 226) Brepols, Turnhout 2007.

— *Homilies on the Gospels*, B.M. Kienzle (tr.), Cistercian Publications – Liturgical Press, Collegeville 2011.

— *The Book of Divine Works*, N.M. Campbell (tr.), The Catholic University of America Press, Washington D.C. 2018.

Sancti Augustini, *Confessionum Libri XIII [Confessiones]*, XI, vi (8), ed. L. Verheijen, (CCSL) Brepols, Turnhout 1981.

— *Confessions*, ed. H. Chadwick, Oxford University Press, New York 2008.

— *Qué es el tiempo*, ed. A. Conti, Trotta, Madrid 2011, p. 28.

### Secondary literature

Carlevaris, A., «Ildegarda e la Patristica», in C. Burnett – P. Dronke (eds.), *Hildegard of Bingen. The Context of her Thought and Art*, The Warburg Institute, London 1998, pp. 65-80.

Cirlot, V., «La ciudad celeste de Hildegard von Bingen», *Anuario de Estudios Medievales* 44, 1 (2014) 505-541.

Conti, A., «Introducción», in Agustín de Hipona, *Qué es el tiempo*, Trota, Madrid 2013.

Cristiani, M. – Panti, C. – Perillo, G. (eds.), «*Harmonia mundi*». *Musica mondana e musica celeste fra Antichità e Medioevo. Atti del Convegno internazionale di studi (Roma, 14-15 dicembre 2005)*, SISMEL - Edizioni del Galluzzo, Florence 2007.

Donke, P., «The Symbolic Cities of Hildegard of Bingen», *The Journal of Medieval Latin* 1 (1991) 168-183

— «Platonic-Christian Allegories in the Homilies of Hildegard of Bingen», in H.J. Westra (ed.), *From Athens to Chartres. Neoplatonism and Medieval Thought. Studies in Honour of Édouard Jauneau*, Brill, Leiden – New York – Cologne 1992, pp. 382-396.

Gössmann, E., «Zirkuläres Denken und kosmische Spekulationen im 12. Erläutert an Hildegard von Bingen und Alanus von Lille», in *Fernöstische Weisheit und christlicher Glaube. Festgabe für Heinrich Dumoulin SJ zur Vollendung des 80. Lebensjahres*, Matthias-Grünewald-Verlag, Mainz 1985.

Gouguenheim, S., *La Sibylle du Rhin: Hildegarde de Bingen, abbesse et prophétesse rhénane*, Publications de la Sorbonne, Paris 1996.

Kienzle, B.M., *Hildegard of Bingen and her Gospel Homilies. Speaking New Mysteries*, Brepols, Turnhout 2009.

Hamburger, J.F., *The Visual and the Visionary: Art and Female Spirituality in Late Medieval Germany*, Zone Books, New York 1998.

Newman, B., «Hildegard of Bingen: Visions and Validation», *Church History* 54, 2 (1985) 163-175.

Panti, C., «*Verbum cordis e ministerium vocis: il canto emozionale di Agostino e le visioni sonore di Ildegarda di Bingen*», in M. Cristiani, – C. Panti, – G. Perillo (eds.), *Musica mondana e musica celeste fra antichità e Medioevo*, Sismel, Firenze, pp. 167-199.

Rabassó, G., «*Sapientia docet me: Hildegard of Bingen and philosophy*», *Mediaevalia. Textos e estudos* 35 (2016) 7-50. <http://ojs.letras.up.pt/index.php/mediaevalia/article/view/2769>.

— «*Subtilitates naturae. Continuitats i ruptures a la cosmologia d'Hildegarda de Bingen (1098-1179)*», doctoral thesis, Universitat de Barcelona, Barcelona 2015. <http://hdl.handle.net/2445/96660>

— *L'univers vivent d'Hildegarda de Bingen: perspectives filosòfiques*, prologue by R. Rius Gatell, Diputació de Barcelona – Institut d'Estudis Catalans, Barcelona 2018.

Ranff, V., «Haben Hildegards Visionen Quellen?», in Ä. Bäumer-Schleinkofer (ed.), *Hildegard von Bingen in ihrem Umfeld - Mystik und Visionsformen in Mittelalter und früher Neuzeit. Katholizismus und Protestantismus im Dialog*, Religion & Kultur-Verlag, Würzburg 2001, pp. 105-121.

Rius Gatell, R., «À la recherche des savoirs anciens. Simone Weil dans l'air du temps», *Cahiers Simone Weil* 37, 3 (2014) 223-238.

Sacks, O., «The Visions of Hildegard», in O. Sacks, *The Man Who Mistook His Wife for a Hat and other clinical tales*, Perennial Library, New York 1985.

Singer, Ch., «The Visions of Hildegard of Bingen», in Ch. Singer, *From Magic to Science. Essays on the Scientific Twilight*, Ernest Benn Ltd, London 1928.

— «The Scientific Views and Visions of St. Hildegard of Bingen», in Ch. Singer (ed.), *Studies in the History and Method of Science*, Clarendon Press, Oxford 1917.

Santos Paz, J.C., «Hildegarde's conscious vision and Adam's dream according to Eriugena», in C. Pisano – D. Solvi (eds.), *Stati alterati di coscienza come pratica rituale. Documenti, testimonianze e rappresentazioni*, Agorà & Co., Lugano 2018, pp. 99-129.