COMMERCIAL AND FAN SUBTITLING OF THE PILOT EPISODE OF THE TV SERIES *FARGO* (2014): DESCRIPTIVE AND COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

Carlos Guimarães[*]
University of Aveiro/FCSH

ABSTRACT: This article carries out a comparative study of the commercial and fan subtitling of the same source text, namely "The Crocodile's Dilemma", the pilot episode of the TV series Fargo (2014). The aim is to ascertain the commonalities and divergences between these two different types of translation with regard to European Portuguese. It seeks to verify if the usual tendency of commercial subtitling being domesticating and fan subtitling foreignizing applies in Portugal or if Portugal deviates from this pattern. Furthermore, the herein article shall also focus on other translational matters outside the domestication and foreignization aspects, although with a bit less coverage. The attention will also shift toward the tackling of taboo language and omission of verbal information between commercial and fan subtitling, with commercial subtitling being typically associated with censorship and omissions, whilst fan subtitling is usually known for its uncensored all-inclusive version. Naturally, the case study of a single pilot episode cannot permit encompassing conclusions to be drawn, but it can provide a peek into the commercial and fan subtitling phenomena in Portugal in order to get a preliminary idea of how it compares to the rest of the world.
KEYWORDS: Commercial Subtitling, Fan Subtitling, Domestication, Foreignization, Censorship, Omissions, Comparative Study, English-To-Portuguese

1. Introduction

Subtitling is one of the most widely used methods of making foreign movies and television shows linguistically accessible to particular national markets (Koolstra et al., 2002, p. 325), but what exactly is understood by the concept of "subtitling"? Díaz-Cintas (2012, p.274) defines it as a translation practice involving a written target language translation, presented at the bottom of the screen, not only of the original dialogue and other verbal information transmitted aurally (such as material from the soundtrack and radio/television broadcasts), but also of any written information which pops up on the screen, like letters and banners.

Amongst the different kinds of subtitling that exist, this article will focus only on (interlingual) commercial and fan subtitling, which entails transcription and captioning processes, as well as translation proper (Liu, 2014, p. 1105). In this type of translation, not only are two languages involved but also two different channels, speech and writing; thus, there is a shift of mode as well as language, with the crossing from speech in the source language into writing in the target language (Liu, 2014, p. 1105).

As regards the difference between commercial and fan subtitling, in broad terms, the former is the subtitling visible on TV, DVD, or in a movie theater, which will have been carried out by a professional remunerated subtitler/translator (Neves, 2007, p. 9; O'Hagan, 2009, p. 101; Pérez-González, 2007, p. 264), while "fan-subbing" is a hobby with no

[*] carlosfilipeguimaraes@ua.pt

monetary reward (Neves, 2007, p. 9; O'Hagan, 2009, p. 101; Pérez-González, 2007, p. 264). There are also differences as regards aims and strategies: the main goal of commercial subtitling is usually to fully integrate the foreign audiovisual product into the target culture to the extent that the viewer is led to believe that the work they are consuming originated in that culture (Pérez-González, 2007, pp. 264-275), while fan subtitling may be motivated by other more personal concerns and prefer a more foreignizing approach (see below).

The article begins by exploring in more depth the differences between commercial and fan subtitling, before moving on to analyse excerpts from the pilot episode of *Fargo* translated into Portuguese by commercial and fan subtitlers.

2. Commercial subtitling

Subtitling, whether commercial or fan-made, is an incredibly challenging task. Lefevere (1985) famously described the five constraints operating on the translation of literature (namely patronage, poetics or ideology, the universe of discourse, natural language, and the constraint of the original work or source text); but in addition to these, audiovisual translation is further constrained by a sixth factor, namely time-space limitations (Pedersen, 2011, p. 130). These are particularly stringent in the case of commercial subtitling, which has to be carried out in compliance with the industry norms and regulations.

Two of the technical restrictions that most affect commercial subtitling practice are *reading speed* and *exposure time*, which are closely related concepts (Pedersen, 2011, p. 130). The former is defined as the speed with which the average reader is expected to read a subtitle and is calculated by dividing the number of characters in a subtitle by the number of seconds that the subtitle is exposed on the screen; thus, the result indicates how many characters the viewer is expected to read per second of exposure time. As for exposure time, this denotes the length of time for which a subtitle will be displayed on screen, which in turn depends on its length. There is no general consensus concerning expected reading speed in Portugal, and guidelines vary according to the platform (e.g. streaming services, television, DVDs, etc.), target audience, particular specifications, amongst other external factors. For example, Netflix (2021) recommend an average reading speed of 17 characters per second with a maximum of 42 characters per line, whilst the subtitling scholar Neves (2007, p. 79) recommends an average reading speed of 12 characters per second with a maximum of 36 characters per line.

Further technicalities and rules which professional subtitlers have to adhere to include: (i) *positioning*: all subtitles must be centered at the very bottom of the screen, in order to free up the image and not take up a lot of space (Neves, 2007, p. 15); (ii) *length*: subtitles can only be one or two lines long (Neves, 2007, pp. 16-41); (iii) *synchronization*: a subtitle should always be synchronized with the utterance it is reproducing, i.e. entering at the exact time a character starts talking and disappearing immediately after (Neves, 2007, pp. 27-28); (iv) *gaps between subtitles*: subtitles cannot immediately follow on one from another without any space between them; that is to say there should be at least two

textless frames between consecutive subtitles (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, pp. 113-114); and (v) *translation brief*: the way the subtitler carries out the procedure is bound by the client's instructions (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, p. 144).

For Neves (2007, pp. 31-32) any kind of subtitling should ideally aim to reproduce and transcribe the oral speech into written text as faithfully as possible, word-for-word, without any omissions, censorship, or additions. However, such an idealistic scenario is seldom feasible, as there are almost always going to be changes in the form of textual additions and subtractions. Still according to Neves (2007, pp. 34-35), omissions should only be used whenever time and space are scarce, and the information is superfluous (e.g. repetitions, names, and greetings), whilst additions should only be used whenever there is time and space for it, and the context warrants it, such as when it is necessary to make explicit ambiguous pronouns and references, in order to improve readability. Similarly, successful subtitling will not only be technically correct but also linguistically adequate and appropriate to the communicative needs of the viewers (Neves, 2007, pp. 81-84). Indeed, it is worth remembering that subtitling is, for many people, either their only or main interaction with written Portuguese, as well as being a vehicle for successful foreign language learning. Thus, it would not be incorrect to perceive subtitling as an important didactic tool (Neves, 2007, pp. 81-84).

3. Fan subtitling

Web 2.0 ushered in the age of Internet users that were no longer passive consumers, but also producers who could freely and willingly contribute to a vast array of content for public consumption. It is within this context that the concept of *user-generated content* (UGC) emerged (Flew, 2008, p. 35), soon giving rise to the related concept of *user-generated translation* (UGT). This term, coined by O'Hagan (2009), encompasses a wide range of translations carried out on the basis of free web-user collaboration on digital media platforms. The entire translation process is carried out by unspecified anonymous self-selected individuals. Hence, the UGT contributor is someone who, from their own volition, plays the role of remediator of otherwise linguistically inaccessible products, drawing on a knowledge of the media content and genre acquired as a direct result of their passion for the subject matter (O'Hagan, 2009, p. 97). In many cases, community translation, collaborative technology and processes, and crowdsourcing all come together to create a form of translation that is generated by and for the people (De Palma and Kelly, 2008, cited in O'Hagan 2009, p. 97).

Internet availability and collaboration tools have given fandoms a means to shift from passive spectators to active *prosumers* (Tapscott and Williams, 2006, cited in O'Hagan, 2009, p. 99). Fan translation fits well within this category, as potential consumers of translations also take on the role of translation producers. The most well-established early form of UGT appeared in the 1980s with the translation of Japanese animated films or *anime* (O'Hagan, 2009, p. 99) produced chiefly by fans for fans (Díaz-Cintas and Muñoz Sánchez, 2006, p. 51).

Web 2.0 technology also saw the fan subtitling of audiovisual content expand to countless types of audiovisual products and genres, and in the early 2000s Web users started craving more English-language content, more specifically American TV shows and movies. According to the European Commission's Directorate-General for Translation (2012, p. 29), the year 2004 marked the advent of fansubbing into other languages with the American television series *Lost*, which at the time was an internationally famous television show. The reason why fan subtitling became prominent around this time was due to the fact that officially subtitled episodes in languages other than English only became available long after the original had been broadcast in the US. International fans would therefore look for the episodes on the Internet as soon as they were aired in the United States, but as many of them did not comprehend English well enough to understand the show, this generated a demand that was met informally by foreign fans that were fluent in English. These would then gather together to translate and subtitle the episodes the day after their original broadcast in the US. Since then, fan subtitling (fansubbing) has become an efficient way of disseminating American television series in non-English speaking countries (2012, pp. 29-30).

Generally speaking, fansubs tend not to conform to audiovisual subtitling norms, and are often experimental or "abusive" in nature, tending towards a foreignizing approach rather than the domestication that is the norm in conventional commercial translation subtitling (Nornes, 2004, pp. 462-467). These norm-bending strategies originate from the fans' desire for "authentic" text (Cubbison, 2005, p. 438). Indeed, fansubs developed largely as a protest against the over-edited dubbed versions of *anime* broadcast on television networks outside Japan, and also against the tendency of commercial subtitling to westernize the genre, erasing all the nuances and idiosyncrasies of Japanese culture (Díaz-Cintas and Muñoz Sánchez, 2006, p. 46; O'Hagan, 2009, p. 100). Thus, for many fandoms, fansubbing provides not only greater source-text fidelity but also rapid availability. It is also seen as preferable to dubbed versions, as fans prefer to hear and feel the original voices and sounds of the source language, which flow much more naturally in the non-dubbed version (Díaz-Cintas and Muñoz Sánchez, 2006, p. 46; Pérez-González, 2007, pp. 264-270).

Many fansubbers tend to not adhere to the strict rules governing commercial translation and, as a result, there is a great deal of fansubbed content online which has an excessive number of lines within the same subtitle, more characters per line than the commercially established limit allows, and long explanatory headnotes centered at the very top of the screen. As these fansubbing practices go against the commercial translation established guidelines, they are deemed to be disruptive practices (Massidda, 2012, pp. 73-92; Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, p. 5).

However, although some early research into this phenomenon labelled all fan subtitling as foreignizing and non-adherent to conventional subtitling norms, more recent studies have actually shown that this is a gross overgeneralization. In fact, there are fan subtitles that are actually target-oriented rather than source-bound, and many that strictly

follow professional standards (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, pp. 5-9). That is to say, just because most of the fansubbing circulating on the Internet tends to be foreignizing and non-conformist, that does not mean all fansub communities carry out subtitling within these molds (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, pp. 5-9). A notable exception, for example, is the Chinese fansubbing of the popular TV series *The Big Bang Theory* (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, pp. 5-9).

According to Orrego-Carmona and Lee (2017), fan subtitling can also be referred to as volunteer subtitling, community subtitling, unprofessional subtitling, or non-professional subtitling, with the term "un/non-professional" suggesting a negative charge (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, pp. 4-5). However, the "un/non-professional" aspect has nothing to do with the subtitler's competence or academic qualifications; rather it refers to whether they are remunerated or not at the end of the subtitling process (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, pp. 4-5). That is to say, remunerated subtitlers are called professional subtitlers, since they are doing it as a profession, whilst the ones who do it voluntarily as a hobby are classified as non-professional subtitlers.

According to Pérez-González (2007, p. 269), from a legal standpoint, fansubbing is unlawful, given that fansubbers do not hold the copyright of the shows they subtitle and are therefore not legally authorized to do it. However, the sheer volume of fansubtitles circulating around the Internet is such, and the target audience for them so vast, that the companies which hold the copyright have no other option but to turn a blind eye, as companies will never be able to prosecute all fan subtitled content online, especially in the future when fan subtitles are projected to increase at an even higher rate (Pérez-González, 2007).

According to O'Hagan (2009, p. 115), unanswered questions regarding ethical issues and translational quality from crowdsourced translations, linger in an environment where the boundary between the professional and amateur translator grows ever more fuzzy. The digital world of Web 2.0 built upon free access, user participation, and mass dissemination, has brought issues which are already seeping into the professional life of translators (O'Hagan, 2009, p. 116). However, leveraging the ongoing changes in the professional translator's favor may help improve the translation profession. In other words, if the target audience clamors for a foreignized translation product produced in a timely manner, then it is a foreignized timely translation which commercial subtitling must start providing, in order to not alienate their audiences even more (O'Hagan, 2009).

4. Case study: *Fargo* (2014)

According to the TV Tropes (2021) website, *Fargo* is a 2014 FX dark comedy and crime drama series based on the Coen Brothers' 1996 movie of the same name, thus drawing inspiration from their whole library of works. However, the Coen Brothers are not actually the creators or writers of the series. That role fell to Noah Hawley, with the brothers taking on the role of executive producers (TV Tropes, 2021). Despite being originally conceived as a one-season miniseries, its commercial success and critical acclaim naturally led to its

subsequent renewal and development into an anthology based around crime in the snowy Midwest (TV Tropes, 2021). Since December 6, 2021, four seasons have been produced, each focusing on a new cast and storyline, yet coexisting within the same world (TV Tropes, 2021). This article will then focus on the pilot episode of the very first season.

The first season is set in 2006 in Bemidji, Minnesota, and follows life insurance salesman Lester Nygaard, portrayed by Martin Freeman, and his downward spiral into crime and darkness, triggered by the persuasive prowess of a shady drifter hitman called Lorne Malvo, played by Billy Bob Thornton. Malvo persuades Lester to stop being so meek and submissive in his underwhelming life, and start lashing out at those who look down on him (TV Tropes, 2021). However, Molly Solverson, played by Allison Tolman, a fearless Sheriff's Deputy, conducts a joint investigation with Officer Gus Grimly, portrayed by Colin Hanks, in a bid to track and incarcerate the two felons (TV Tropes, 2021).

4.1 Source and target texts

The source text for this research is the 69-minute-long pilot episode "The Crocodile's Dilemma", which was initially broadcasted on April 15, 2014, on the *FX* television channel in the United States (TV Tropes, 2021). It was selected because it is full of idiomatic expressions, cultural references, slang, and offensive language, which provides a solid foundation from which to examine how a professional and amateur subtitler in completely different work environments tackle these translational matters. In particular, it should be possible to identify any cases of omission and/or censorship.

The first target text of the research is the version commercially subtitled in European Portuguese which aired in 2016 on the Portuguese AMC channel (AMC, 2016), which the NOS TV streaming platform hosts on demand on their NOS Play series and movies library. The translation and subtitling of the episode is credited to Jorge Filho, a professional subtitler from the Lisbon-based subtitling company *JIPI multiMedia* (Yellow Place, 2021).

The second target text is a fan-subtitled version, also in European Portuguese, that was uploaded to the OpenSubtitles.org platform, the web's largest free subtitles database, where any user can produce and upload their own subtitles or download and view them free of charge (Brookes, 2010, 1-23). With regard to *Fargo's* pilot episode, the platform offers 15 different choices for Portuguese subtitles, 10 in Brazilian Portuguese and 5 in European Portuguese. Out of the 5 European Portuguese subtitles available, the one chosen was the file on top of the list, (i.e. the most recent), which had been uploaded by one of the website's administrators *MaSousa* on December 6, 2015 (it was selected because this project is trying to focus on more recent fan subtitling practices). In this case, the translation and subtitling were credited to the *YipeeKiYay* and *kunundrum* usernames, while the synchronization and proofreading were credited to the *PEN* username. Thus, the work will be credited to these three usernames and not the uploader, who is not mentioned in the subtitling file.

5. Descriptive and comparative analysis

This section will focus on describing and comparing the commercial and fan translations of the episode in order to identify their translational commonalities and divergences, as well as to verify if the translational tradition of commercial subtitling being domesticating and fan subtitling foreignizing also holds true for this European Portuguese case study.

This section will also be divided into various subsections in accordance with the translational matter being discussed, namely cultural references, offensive language, idiomatic expressions, and omissions.

5.1 Cultural references

A cultural reference is understood to be a real-life phenomenon which exists within a given culture and is conveyed through the language of that same culture. Hence, the original target audience is usually able to grasp the cultural reference through their shared cultural experience and background (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, p. 202), though this may prove problematic for audiences receiving the work through translation. Cultural references can be divided into real-word cultural references and intertextual cultural references, with the former denoting items stemming from a specific culture (e.g. cuisine, military institutions, physical locations, etc), whilst the latter refers to human-made cultural artefacts (e.g. books, movies, television shows, video games, etc). (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, pp. 203-206).

When it comes to employing the right translational strategy to successfully tackle a cultural reference, this is not a black-and-white one-dimensional matter, but rather a nuanced multi-faceted one. Various matters must be factored in beforehand, including, but not limited to, transculturality (i.e. the extent to which a cultural reference is recognizable to the target culture audience); the importance of the cultural reference to the overall scene and narrative; the amount of information conveyed by the visuals and soundtrack (this will subsequently determine the amount of information required for the subtitles); the technicalities and restrictions imposed by the subtitling guidelines, etc. (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, pp. 204-205).

Generally, the nine most employed translational strategies for dealing with cultural references are: loans, i.e. the source language word is directly incorporated into the target language without any changes; literal translations, i.e. rendering the source language elements literally into the target language in a manner which sounds natural to the target audience; calques, i.e. a literal translation from the source language into the target language that comes across as foreign-sounding to the target reader/watcher; explicitations, i.e. explicitly introducing information into the target language which is only manifested implicitly in the source language; substitutions, i.e. replacing the cultural reference in the source language with a similar target language reference, or with a target language expression that fits the given situation but reveals no link to the source language expression; transpositions, i.e. a cultural concept from the source language is replaced by its target language counterpart; lexical recreations, i.e. whenever the source language

speaker makes up new words, the subtitler can then invent neologisms in the target language as equivalents for the source language fictional words; compensations, i.e. trying to make up for a translational loss that occurred in a previous subtitle by adding extra information/content to a posterior subtitle; and, lastly, omissions, i.e. erasing source language terms and expressions from the target language, whether it be due to fast-paced speech, unbeknownst cultural references to the target audience, and/or absence of target language equivalents (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, pp. 207-217). As mentioned above, it is often claimed that commercial subtitling tends to favor domesticating approaches, whilst fan subtitling leans more toward foreignization, at least in most abroad cases. To verify if this holds true for this case study, illustrative examples have been provided in Tables 1 to 3.

The first example concerns the use of imperial versus metric measurements, as shown in Table 1 below.

Source Text	**Commercial Subtitling**	**Fan Subtitling**	**Timestamp**
"Supposed to get down to negative 10 later" (Hawley et al., 2014)	"Pode chegar aos 10 graus negativos mais tarde" (Hawley et al., 2014) (Filho, Trans.)	"É suposto chegar aos 23 negativos mais logo" (Hawley et al., 2014) (YipeeKiYay et al., Trans.)	17:19
Context: Two police officers discussing the weather.			

Table 1. "Supposed to get down to negative 10 later" translation.

Although it is not explicitly stated within the source text, the minus 10 degrees are Fahrenheit, since that is the temperature scale used in the US. The commercial subtitling used this implicitness to its favor either by simply failing to elucidate or by preserving the Fahrenheit scale, perhaps on the assumption that the target audience would never notice it under these circumstances. However, the fan subtitlers went through the extra work of converting the -10°F to the Celsius scale, which gives -23°C.

The second example concerns forms of address, as given in Table 2.

Source Text	**Commercial Subtitling**	**Fan Subtitling**	**Timestamp**
"Mr. Mickey"	"Mr. Mickey"	"Sr. Mickey"	38:33
"Mrs. Hess"	"Mrs. Hess"	"Sra. Hess"	40:03
Context: Lorne Malvo disguised as a lawyer talking to Sam Hess' older son.			

Table 2. "Mr. Mickey & Mrs. Hess" translation.

In this case, the commercial subtitling chose to keep the English forms of address, i.e. Mr. and Mrs., while the fan subtitling adapted them to their respective Portuguese equivalents, namely "Sr." and "Sra.".

The third example concerns a reference to American football, a game which is barely known in Portugal (Table 3).

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Kicked in another field goal"	"Foi um pontapé de 3 pontos"	"Mais um golo de campo"	01:01:25
Context: Discussion about American football.			

Table 3. "Kicked in another field goal" translation.

Both translations kept the American football reference, meaning neither of them tried to adapt it to soccer, which is the sport most familiar to the target audience.

5.2 Offensive language

Offensive language contains taboo and stigmatized cultural elements and is usually employed to convey strong emotions and/or attitudes, or to shock the reader/listener. Thus, its function within a given context is more important than its literal meaning (Hawel, 2019, p. 425). However, the emotional impact that it will have on the reader/listener will obviously depend on their culture and language (Hawel, 2019, p. 426). For this reason, offensive language constitutes a problem for translators, especially for professional subtitlers, who are constrained in their choice of terms by the restrictions placed on them (Hawel, 2019, p. 426). In Portugal, in particular, professional subtitlers have been shown to euphemize and omit offensive language in the light of the country's conservative stance on swearing and taboo language (Xavier, 2019, pp. 374-390).

However, fan subtitlers, who do not have to answer to any clients, superiors or translation/subtitling companies, can make use of any translation strategy that they deem appropriate, including preserving the offensive language in the target language (Hawel, 2019, p. 426). It is therefore interesting to find out how the offensive language was tackled in this case study, both in the commercial and fan subtitling.

The source text in the first case (Table 4) entails two translational problems, wordplay between the racial slur "nigger" and Lester's surname "Nygaard," and of course, the offensiveness of the slur in question.

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Lester Niggered"	"Lester Negro"	"Lester Negro"	07:42
Context: Sam Hess bullying Lester after bumping into him in the street.			

Table 4. "Lester Niggered" translation.

Although the Portuguese language does not allow the source wordplay to exert the same linguistic effect as it does in English, the translations nevertheless managed to convey the speaker's intention. The callousness, however, was toned down significantly, given that the word "negro" is actually the politically correct way to address a black person in the target culture. In order for the wordplay and crassness to both be conveyed in Portuguese, then the translation would have to be, "Lester Preto", which of course loses the wordplay component.

The next two examples concern sexual slang. In the first case (Table 5), the wording in the commercial subtitling is much more offensive than in the fan subtitling, while in the second (Table 6), the expression is euphemized in both translations (a more offensive but faithful rendition of this slang would be, "casa de putas").

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"You know, she gave me a tug once"	"Ela bateu-me uma punheta"	"Sabes, uma vez ela fez-me um trabalhinho"	09:02
Context: Sam Hess talking about Lester's wife.			

Table 5. "You know, she gave me a tug once" translation.

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Whorehouse"	"Bordel"	"Casa de alterne"	38:00
Context: Sam Hess's wife describing the place in which her husband got murdered.			

Table 6. "Whorehouse" translation.

As regards the scatological language given in Table 7 below, both translations are faithful renditions of the slang word "shit," with neither trying to euphemize it as "porcaria".

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"The shit they make us eat"	"A merda que nos fazem comer"	"As merdas que nos obrigam a engolir"	44:26
Context: Lorne Malvo telling Lester what society makes people go through.			

Table 7. "The shit they make us eat" translation.

5.3 Idiomatic expressions

Idiomatic expressions can be loosely defined as figures of speech comprising a string of words which, when clustered together, convey a different meaning collectively than they would if every single word were to be interpreted individually (Longman Idioms Dictionary, 1998, cited in Shojaei, 2012, p. 1221). As a result, idiomatic expressions can never be

broken down into singular units, but instead should be dealt with as fixed expressions (Balfaqeeh, 2009, cited in Shojaei, 2012, p. 1221). Such expressions can thus describe aspects of perceptible and imperceptible reality in a more comprehensible and concise manner than is feasible to achieve with literal language (Strakšiene, 2009, p. 14, cited in Shojaei, 2012, p. 1221).

Idiomatic expressions are particularly hard to translate: indeed, the translator may not even realise that they are in the presence of an idiomatic expression at all. And even when they do, translating it may be troublesome, as there may not be a target language counterpart, or an apparent counterpart may convey a completely different meaning (Shojaei, 2012, pp. 1222-1223).

When tackling the subtitling of foreign idiomatic expressions, the most commonly employed translation strategies tend to be loan, literal translation, calque, explicitation, substitution, transposition, lexical recreation, compensation, and omission (Díaz-Cintas and Remael, 2021, p. 207; Vinay and Darbelnet, 1958, p. 90). Tables 8 to 12 below provide some examples of how idiomatic expressions from this episode of *Fargo* have been treated by the subtitlers in question.

Source Text	**Commercial Subtitling**	**Fan Subtitling**	**Timestamp**
"Bet that set them back a penny"	"Aposto que ficaram lisos"	"Aposto que lhes custou muito dinheiro"	03:19
Context: This idiomatic expression was uttered by Lester Nygaard, the main character, upon hearing from his wife that his younger brother and his wife had bought an expensive washing machine.			

Table 8. "Bet that set them back a penny" translation.

In this example, the commercial translator found an equivalent idiomatic expression in the target language, whilst the fan translators opted to instead make explicit the meaning of the English idiom, rather than replacing it with a Portuguese equivalent. Both translations are of course perfectly understandable to the target audience.

In the example given in Table 9 below, interestingly, both translations opted to translate this idiom in a rather literal manner, by preserving the idea that the woman was discussing clothes for girls, when in reality the underlying meaning behind this idiom in this context is that the mother really wants her child to be a girl (though this idea is implicit in both translations).

Source Text	**Commercial Subtitling**	**Fan Subtitling**	**Timestamp**
"I'd just about hug the pants off a little girl"	"Adoro as roupas para meninas"	"Acabei de ajeitar umas calças para menina"	05:53
Context: A pregnant woman, who does not know the gender of her baby, is talking to Lester, who is trying to sell her life insurance at his workplace.			

Table 9. "I'd just about hug the pants off a little girl" translation.

In the case given in Table 10 below, the commercial subtitling opted to find an equivalent Portuguese idiom, "cabeça de alho choco," while the fan subtitling went for a literal rendition, "cérebro do tamanho de uma batata".

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Dad said that he also thinks you've got a potato brain"	"Também disse que acha que tens cabeça de alho choco"	"O pai também pensa que tens um cérebro do tamanho de uma batata"	21:41
Context: An older brother joking with his younger brother.			

Table 10. "You've got a potato brain" translation.

The next expression (Table 11) also contains a cultural reference, namely to the sport of baseball, which is not particularly well known in the target culture. In both translations, the cultural reference was simply eliminated and the basic meaning of the expression made explicit.

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Steak big as a catcher's mitt"	"Um bife do tamanho do prato"	"Um bife gigantesco"	24:45
Context: Chazz Nygaard, Lester's younger brother, talking to Lester about a steak he ate.			

Table 11. "Steak big as a catcher's mitt" translation.

In the next example, however (Table 12), the technique employed by the fan translation was actually the opposite of this strategy, with the insertion of an equivalent Portuguese idiomatic expression. The commercial subtitler, on the other hand, chose to use an explicative translation.

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Yeah, with the two boys, both dumb as a dog's foot"	"Sim, que tem dois filhos parvos como tudo"	"Sim, aquele que tem dois filhos burros como uma porta"	32:30
Context: The Sheriff talking about Sam Hess' sons.			

Table 12. "Both dumb as a dog's foot" translation.

5.4. Omissions

As stated by Neves (2007), in an ideal situation, a professional subtitler should not have to resort to omissions. However, time and space constraints may sometimes compel the subtitler to omit certain bits of information (Neves, 2007, pp. 31-35). This phenomenon is

not usually observed so much in fan subtitling, given that fan subtitlers are not bound by subtitling/television companies' restrictions (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, p. 5). However, as recent studies have shown that some fan subtitling communities approach their translation practice as if it were taking place in a professional environment, adhering to all the subtitling norms (Orrego-Carmona and Lee, 2017, pp. 5-9), we might wonder how the Portuguese fan subtitling community will react. Tables 13 to 15 gives examples from this case study. The first concerns the transfer of forms of address.

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Excuse me, **Miss**"	"Desculpe"	"Desculpe, **menina**"	10:37
"No, **mister**, we're not friends"	"Não somos amigos"	"Não, **senhor**, nós não somos amigos"	14:17
"**Sir**, it's real busy"	"Tenho muito que fazer"	"**Senhor**, temos muito trabalho"	16:07
"Only two reasons to come to my shop, **friend**"	"Só há duas razões para vir à minha empresa"	"Só há duas razões para vir às minhas instalações, **amigo**"	22:48
"**Son**, she compared you to a clam"	"Ela comparou-te com um molusco"	"Ela comparou-te a um mexilhão, **rapaz**"	34:40

Table 13. Omissions of forms of address.

As we can see in Table 13 above, the commercial subtitling opted to omit every single form of address present within the source text, whilst the fan subtitling preserved them all.

A similar pattern can be seen in Table 14, concerning the omission of slang. That is to say, all the source text slang presented here were omitted in the commercial subtitling but maintained and translated in the fan subtitling.

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Or say you're up a ladder, cleaning up the gutters and you fall off the **darn** thing and break your neck?"	"Ou se estiver num escadote, a limpar o algeroz, cair e partir o pescoço?"	"Ou digamos sobe ao escadote para limpar uma calha e vai da **maldita** coisa e parte o pescoço?"	06:20
"What the **heck**"	(complete omission)	"Que **raio**"	41:18

"I'm trying to fix the **darn** thing"	"Estou a tentar arranjar esta coisa"	"Estou a tentar consertar esta **maldita** coisa"	47:45

Table 14. Omission of slang.

Finally, fan subtitling seems to preserve all kinds of information, whilst commercial subtitling seems to only keep the most important elements and anything the professional subtitler deems as superfluous, gets cut from the translation (Table 15).

Source Text	Commercial Subtitling	Fan Subtitling	Timestamp
"Took the whole team down to Duluth **Tuesday**"	"Levei toda a equipa até Duluth"	"Levei a equipa toda a Duluth, **na terça-feira**"	24:31
"Real intense"	(complete omission)	"Algo estranho"	46:30

Table 15. Omission of information.

6. Discussion

After analyzing all 15 translational examples, we can conclude that neither the commercial nor fan subtitling were completely foreignizing or domesticating in their approach, as both versions had domesticating and foreignizing aspects to them. Both tried to adapt and find equivalent Portuguese idiomatic expressions for the English ones, and adapted or omitted American cultural realities which the target audience may not be familiar with (such as the baseball reference). But foreignizing aspects were also present in both translations: for example, the American football reference was maintained without any attempt to adapt it to the more familiar soccer lexicon.

However, despite this commonality, the fan subtitling is actually (and unexpectedly) a much more domesticating translation in comparison to the commercial subtitling, which leans more toward the foreignization. The fan subtitlers went through the extra work of converting the Fahrenheit scale into Celsius, and finding the equivalent Portuguese forms of address for the English ones. The commercial translation, on the other hand, preserved both the Fahrenheit scale and the English forms of address.

Regarding offensive content, no significant differences were spotted between commercial and fan subtitling. Despite there being no cases of complete censorship via omission and manipulation of the message in either subtitling, there were two instances of euphemization with the expressions "Niggered" and "whorehouse", softened in both translations. In spite of this, there were also instances where both translations preserved the force of the source slang, such as "shit" being translated as "merda" rather than being toned down to "porcaria", as might have been expected. There was also one instance of the commercial translation actually being much more offensive than the fan translation, when "tug" was translated as "punheta" by the professional subtitler, while the fan subtitlers decided to tone it down to "trabalhinho".

When it comes to omissions, the commercial subtitling decided to omit forms of address (i.e. mister, friend, son, miss, and sir), certain forms of slang (i.e. heck and darn), and superfluous information [i.e. days of the week (Tuesday) and intensifying adjectives (real intense)]. In these cases, it is noteworthy that the fan subtitlers did not resort to omission instead choosing to convey every aspect of spontaneous oral discourse to the target audience. Although the commercial subtitling omissions could be accounted for by time and space constraints, there were also instances in which there was more than enough time and space to preserve all the information, yet the professional subtitler still omitted some of it. External factors outside the subtitler's control (such as client's guidelines, company policy, orders from above, etc.) may have played a role in this, though the real reason remains to be ascertained.

7. Conclusion

As discussed above, commercial subtitling is traditionally associated with a more domesticating approach to translation, while fan subtitling tends to favor a foreignizing approach. However, surprisingly, the findings of this European Portuguese case study actually reveal quite the opposite, with the commercial subtitling being the more foreignizing one and the fan subtitling being the more domesticating one. These results then lead to more questions. In Portugal, is commercial subtitling foreignizing and fan subtitling domesticating? If so, why is it the reverse of what happens in most parts of the world? Have Portuguese professional subtitlers, and subtitling companies as whole, already given in to the clamor for foreignized translations by fandoms? And if that is the case, then why is fan translation heading in the opposite direction to what it is expected to take? Could this case study then be an irregularity within the Portuguese commercial and fan subtitling status quo or is it in conformity with it?

This article's results not only open up avenues for future translational research on the matter of foreignization and domestication, but also within the subject of translation omissions. As we have seen, the commercial translation, in this case study, omits all traits of spontaneous oral discourse, while fan subtitling conserves them and drives that fact home. But why is this the case? What are the underlying reasons that might explain this omission discrepancy between fan and commercial subtitling?

As regards offensive content, there is no evidence that either type of subtitling explicitly censored it via omission or by twisting the intended message. However, two cases of euphemization were encountered, which begs the question of what the criteria were for the rendition of these kinds of terms. The fact that "Niggered" and "whorehouse" were respectively toned down to "Negro" and "bordel/casa de alterne" might have something to do with the fact that, in Portugal, lewd and racist language are amongst the most censored subject matters (Xavier, 2019, p. 379), while scatology is one of the least stigmatized topic, and tends to be faithfully rendered into European Portuguese (Xavier, 2019, p. 379). We see this reflected in the fact that "shit" was translated literally as "merda/merdas" and not euphemized to "porcaria." However, the trend is belied by the

word "tug", which, as we have seen, was translated as "punheta" in the commercial subtitling. The explanation might lie in the fact that this utterance was delivered in a humorous manner (unlike "whorehouse"), which may have contributed to the decision, since Portugal is predisposed to safeguard comedic taboo, i.e. preserve offensive language uttered in a comedic context, as a means to try to convey the humor (Xavier, 2019, p. 380). Further research is then required to draw more assertive and certain conclusions.

Naturally, this paper is limited in its scope and therefore could not, in itself, provide answers to the above questions. A follow-up project with a wider sample pool, comprising several entire television shows and movies rather than just a single episode, might offer a greater insight into the phenomena of commercial and fan subtitling in Portugal.

REFERENCES

AMC (2016) 'AMC Portugal - 10 razões para ver e rever Fargo!', AMC Portugal [online]. Available at: https://www.amctv.pt/blog/10-razoes-para-ver-e-rever-fargo (Accessed: 6 December 2021).

Brookes, T. (2010) *OpenSubtitles - the Web's largest, completely free searchable subtitles database*. MakeUseOf [online]. Available at: https://www.makeuseof.com/tag/opensubtitlesorg-webs-largest-completely-free-searchable-subtitles-database/ (Accessed: 6 December 2021).

Cubbison, L. (2005) 'Anime fans, dvd's, and the authentic text', *The velvet light trap*, *56*(1), pp. 45–57 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1353/vlt.2006.0004 (Accessed: 10 December 2021).

Díaz-Cintas, J. (2012) 'Subtitling', *The routledge handbook of translation studies*, pp. 285–299 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203102893.ch20 (Accessed: 9 December 2021).

Díaz-Cintas, J. and Muñoz Sánchez, P. (2006) 'Fansubs: audiovisual translation in an amateur environment', *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 6, pp. 37–52 [online]. Available at: https://jostrans.org/issue06/art_diaz_munoz.php (Accessed: 10 December 2021).

Díaz-Cintas, J. and Remael, A. (2021) *Subtitling: concepts and practices (translation practices explained)*. Routledge.

European Union. European Commission. Directorate-General for Translation, Europese Commissie, Unia Europejska. Urząd Publikacji, Komisja Europejska, Comisión Europea, European Commission. Directorate-General for Translation, Europäische Kommission. Generaldirektion Übersetzung, Unia Europejska. Urząd Publikacji, and Komisja Europejska. (2012). *Crowdsourcing Translation*. UTB [online]. Available at: https://termcoord.eu/wp-content/uploads/2013/08/Crowdsourcing-translation.pdf (Accessed: 11 December 2021)

Flew, T. (2008) *New Media: an introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hawel, Z. S. (2019) 'Strategies of subtitling swear words in the wolf of wall street movie', *Lark Journal of Philosophy, Linguistics and Social Sciences*, *3*(34), pp. 423–432 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.31185/lark.vol3.iss34.1101 (Accessed: 4 June 2022).

Hawley, N. (Writer & Executive Producer), Hanks C. (Writer), Close J. (Writer) and Bernstein A. (Director & Executive Producer) (2014). The Crocodile's Dilemma (Season 1,

Episode 1) [TV series episode]. In J. Coen, E. Coen (Executive Producers), Fargo. Nomadic Pictures; 26 Keys Productions; The Littlefield Company; Mike Zoss Productions; FXP; MGM Television; 20th Television; Disney–ABC Domestic Television; MGM Domestic Television Distribution; NOS TV.

Hawley, N. (Writer & Executive Producer), Hanks C. (Writer), Close, J. (Writer) and Bernstein, A. (Director & Executive Producer). (2014). The Crocodile's Dilemma (Season 1, Episode 1) [TV series episode]. (Jorge Filho, Trans.). In J. Coen, E. Coen (Executive Producers), *Fargo*. Nomadic Pictures; 26 Keys Productions; The Littlefield Company; Mike Zoss Productions; FXP; MGM Television; 20th Television; Disney–ABC Domestic Television; MGM Domestic Television Distribution; NOS TV.

Hawley, N. (Writer & Executive Producer), Hanks C. (Writer), Close J. (Writer) and Bernstein A. (Director & Executive Producer). (2014, April 15). The Crocodile's Dilemma (Season 1, Episode 1) [TV series episode]. (YipeeKiYay, kunundrum, & PEN, Trans.). In J. Coen, E. Coen (Executive Producers), *Fargo*. Nomadic Pictures; 26 Keys Productions; The Littlefield Company; Mike Zoss Productions; FXP; MGM Television; 20th Television; Disney–ABC Domestic Television; MGM Domestic Television Distribution; NOS TV.

Koolstra, C. M., Peeters, A. L. and Spinhof, H. (2002) 'The Pros and Cons of Dubbing and Subtitling', *European Journal of Communication*, *17*(3), pp. 325–354 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1177/0267323102017003694 (Accessed: 9 December 2021).

Lefevere, A. (1985) 'Why waste our time on rewrites?', *The Manipulation of Literature (Routledge Revivals)*, pp. 215–243 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315759029-12 (Accessed: 15 December 2021).

Liu, D. (2014) 'On the classification of subtitling', *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 5(5), pp. 1103–1109 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.5.5.1103-1109 (Accessed: 9 December 2021).

Massidda, S. (2012) 'The italian fansubbing phenomenon', *Università degli Studi di Sassari Dipartimento di Teorie e Ricerche dei Sistemi Culturali* [online]. Available at: https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/11693862.pdf (Accessed: 17 December 2021).

Netflix (2021) 'Portuguese Timed Text Style Guide', *Netflix | Partner Help Center*. [online]. Available at: https://partnerhelp.netflixstudios.com/hc/en-us/articles/216787938-Portuguese-Timed-Text-Style-Guide (Accessed: 1 June 2022).

Neves, J. (2007) *Guia de legendagem para surdos. Vozes que se vêem*. 1st edn., Offsetlis: Leiria [online]. Available at: https://iconline.ipleiria.pt/bitstream/10400.8/411/1/vkv%20interior.pdf (Accessed: 9 December 2021).

Nornes, A. M. (2004) 'For an abusive subtitling', in Venuti, L. (ed.), *The Translation Studies Reader*, 2nd edn., pp. 447–469 [online]. Routledge. Available at: https://www.academia.edu/1863506/_Toward_an_Abusive_Subtitling_Illuminating_Cinema_s_Apparatus_of_Translation_ (Accessed: 20 December 2021).

O'Hagan, M. (2009) 'Evolution of user-generated translation', *The Journal of Internationalization and Localization*, *1*, pp. 94–121 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1075/jial.1.04hag (Accessed: 15 January 2022).

Orrego-Carmona, D., and Lee, Y. (2017) 'Non-Professional subtitling', *Cambridge Scholars Publishing* [online]. Available at: https://www.cambridgescholars.com/resources/pdfs/978-1-4438-9585-9-sample.pdf (Accessed: 17 January 2022).

Pedersen, J. (2011) 'Subtitling norms for television', 98, *Van Haren Publishing* [online]. Available at: https://jvinfo.nu/LMEDIA/Advanced_Translation_on_Subtitling.pdf (Accessed: 4 January 2022).

Pérez-González, L. (2007) 'Fansubbing anime: insights into the "butterfly effect" of globalisation on audiovisual translation', *Perspectives*, *14*(4), 260–277 [online]. Available at: https://www.academia.edu/4488399/_2007_Fansubbing_Anime_Insights_into_the_Butterfly_Effect_of_Globalisation_on_Audiovisual_Translation (Accessed: 5 January 2022).

Shojaei, A. (2012) 'Translation of idioms and fixed expressions: strategies and difficulties', *Theory and practice in language studies*, *2*(6), pp. 1220–1229 [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4304/tpls.2.6.1220-1229 (Accessed: 5 June 2022).

TV Tropes (2020a) *Series / Fargo*. [online], Available at: https://tvtropes.org/pmwiki/pmwiki.php/Series/Fargo, (Accessed: 19 January 2022).

TV Tropes (2020b) *Series / Fargo season one*, [online]. Available at: https://tvtropes.org/pmwiki/pmwiki.php/Series/FargoSeasonOne (Accessed: 19 January 2022).

Vinay, J. P. and Darbelnet, J. (1995) *Comparative stylistics of French and English* (1st edn.). *Van Haren Publishing* [online]. Available at: https://doi.org/10.7202/037271ar (Accessed: 5 June 2022).

Xavier, C. D. S. A. (2019) 'Tabu e tradução audiovisual: um estudo descritivo das normas de tradução para legendagem de linguagem tabu em contexto televisivo', PhD diss., Universidade de Lisboa - Faculdade de Letras [online]. Available at: https://repositorio.ul.pt/bitstream/10451/37755/1/ulfl258376_td.pdf (Accessed: 8 June 2022).

Yellow Place (2021) *JIPI multimedia - Carnaxide, Portugal* [online]. Available at: https://yellow.place/pt/jipi-multimedia-carnaxide-portugal (Accessed: 18 January 2022).

About the author: Carlos Guimarães is a translation aficionado whose interest is piqued by audiovisual translation in particular. Currently, he is a first-year PhD student of the Translation and Terminology program at the University of Aveiro and Faculty of Social and Human Sciences at NOVA University Lisbon, working on his doctoral dissertation titled "Descriptive and Comparative Analysis Between the Commercial and Fan Subtitling of American TV Shows and Movies into European Portuguese", with this published paper serving as a prelude to the future dissertation.